



---

## **A Report of the: Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee**

# **Annual Report**

**2017- 2018**



---

**Cardiff Council**

## Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee Membership



Councillor Nigel Howells  
(Chairperson)



Councillor Saeed Ebrahim



Councillor Iona Gordon



Councillor Gavin Hill-John



Councillor Thomas Parkhill



Councillor Adrian Robson



Councillor Abdul Sattar



Councillor Ed Stubbs

## TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

- To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of economic regeneration.
  - Cardiff City Region City Deal
  - Inward Investment and the marketing of Cardiff
  - South East Wales Economic Forum
  - Economic Strategy & Employment
  - European Funding & Investment
  - Small to Medium Enterprise Support
  - Cardiff Harbour Authority
  - Lifelong Learning
  - Leisure Centres
  - Sports Development
  - Parks & Green Spaces
  - Libraries, Arts & Culture
  - Civic Buildings
  - Events & Tourism
  - Strategic Projects
  - Innovation & Technology Centres
  - Local Training & Enterprise
  
- To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.
  
- To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures, which may enhance Council performance or service delivery in this area.

## CHAIR'S FOREWORD

This year has been a busy time for the Committee. New councillors joined scrutiny for the first time, experienced councillors joined from other scrutiny committees and we had a new administration. For these reasons, we used this year to provide Committee Members with a good grounding in the main areas covered by our terms of reference and the key tools for successful scrutiny. I am pleased to note all but one of the Committee Members are remaining for 2018-19 and I look forward to working with them to focus our scrutiny on where we can best add value.

Significant areas of the new administration's priorities fall within this Committee's terms of reference. Coupled with this, there are substantial changes to Welsh Government programmes focusing on regeneration. We have ensured these are scrutinised but have also made time to focus on key services that are immediately visible to residents and communities, where there have been considerable changes in recent years, such as libraries, hubs, sports and leisure services. A crucial project that cuts across both regeneration and service delivery is the planned Bus Station; we have kept a close eye on progress with this and we will continue to do so in 2018-19, with a particular focus on the interface with the Central Train Station and adjacent planned developments.

I would like to thank all those who have supported our scrutiny this year, including Cabinet Members and senior officers, partner organisations and, most importantly, service users and residents whose feedback gives us a detailed insight into the issues they face and so helps us to focus our scrutiny on the areas that matter.

A major piece of work undertaken this year has been our inquiry into how to ensure our Parks and Green Spaces services continue to flourish in a time of austerity. I am sincerely grateful to all those who contributed ideas, experiences and expertise and to my task group colleagues, Councillor Gavin Hill-John and Councillor Iona Gordon, for their time and assistance in undertaking and completing this important report, which should help the administration to identify a clear way forward for income generation and cost reduction.



The year ahead will be busy, with City Deal scrutiny, a new vision for Economic Development and more changes to services. I look forward to ensuring scrutiny focuses on citizens, holds Cabinet to account for its decisions, and works constructively to ensure better policies and services for Cardiff.

**Councillor Nigel Howells**  
**Chair, Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee**

## 2017-18 INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW

The Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing policy development across a range of Council services. The Committee hears from a range of witnesses to inform this work, including relevant Cabinet Members, council officers, partner organisations, citizens and service users. During 2017–18, Committee Members scrutinised items across several Cabinet Portfolio areas, as follows:

- Cllr Huw Thomas – Leader
- Cllr Peter Bradbury – Culture & Leisure
- Cllr Russell Goodway – Investment & Development
- Cllr Sarah Merry – Education, Employment & Skills
- Cllr Lynda Thorne – Housing & Communities.

The Directorates predominantly covered by the Committee's terms of reference are Economic Development; City Operations<sup>1</sup>; and People & Communities. This report presents the Committee's activities during 2017-18 and, where possible, identifies the impact of the Committee's work upon the areas within its remit. Between July 2017<sup>2</sup> and May 2018, the Committee scrutinised a wide range of topics, which are listed below, with a particular emphasis on the Cardiff Bus Station project.

### **Inquiries**

Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet.

- 'Funding of Parks'.

### **Policy Development and/or Review**

Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required.

---

<sup>1</sup> This refers to the 'Parks, Sports, Leisure & Cardiff Harbour Authority' section, which were part of the City Operations Directorate at the start of 2017-18; they have now moved to the Economic Development Directorate.

<sup>2</sup> Scrutiny Committee meetings commenced in July, following the local elections in May 2018.

- Employment Services in Cardiff
- Adult Community Learning Proposed Funding Changes
- Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena
- Cardiff Bus Station
- Cardiff Central Train Station
- Economic Development Green Paper
- Targeted Regeneration Initiative Programme
- Sports Development Joint Venture
- Leisure Management Partnership with GLL
- Local Sports Plan 2018-19

### **Pre-Decision**

Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision.

- Funding the new Bus Transport Interchange
- Employment Services in Cardiff
- Urgent Confidential Item (November)
- Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena Business Plan
- Cardiff Capital Region City Deal Joint Working Agreement Business Plan
- International Sports Village (ISV)
- Bus Station – New Approach to Delivery

### **Monitoring**

Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance and progress in implementing actions previously agreed.

- Corporate Plan 2018-21 and Budget 2018/19
- Quarterly Performance Reports – Economic Development; City Operations; People & Communities: Housing and Communities.
- Welsh Public Library Standards 5<sup>th</sup> Framework
- Chief Librarians' Universal Offers
- Summer Reading Challenge 2017
- Adult Community Learning Success Rates.

## **Call- In**

Where a non-Executive Member invokes the Call-In procedure under the Council's Constitution, to review an Executive Decision prior to implementation.

- Funding the new Bus Transport Interchange

Over the period July 2017 – May 2018 the Committee held fourteen committee meetings<sup>3</sup> and wrote 23 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments, recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. On occasion, Members also requested additional information to help with future scrutiny. The Committee received timely responses from the Cabinet to nearly all letters that requested a response. Additional information has been provided where requested.

## **Scrutiny Member Induction and Training**

---

Following the May 2017 local elections, new Councillors were offered training to assist them in their scrutiny role, as follows:

- Scrutiny stall at the Members Induction session – May 2017
- Introduction to Scrutiny – June 2017
- Chairing Skills – June 2017
- Questioning Skills – July 2017
- Budget Training – February 2018

The following pages highlight the Committee's key activities during 2017-18 and identify the comments and recommendations made.

---

<sup>3</sup> Including 2 joint meetings with Environmental Scrutiny Committee to consider the Cabinet report and subsequent Call-In of the 'Funding the new Bus Transport Interchange' and 2 special meetings, on 13 February 2018 and 27 March 2018, to undertake pre-decision scrutiny of significant proposals for the Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena and Cardiff Bus Station, respectively.

## Funding of Parks

---

This Inquiry provided a timely assessment of how, with Cardiff Council facing £91 million savings over the next three years, the Council can continue to provide excellent Parks and Green Spaces. Members explored a wide range of income generation and cost reduction approaches used by other local authorities across the U.K. and examined Parks funding models successfully used elsewhere in the World.

To inform the Inquiry, Members invited contributions from a range of stakeholders, including Friends Groups, sports pitch users and partner wildlife organisations. Members also heard from the Cardiff Civic Society, Urban Park Rangers and Community Park Rangers, senior officers and Councillor Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Parks and Green Spaces.

Our findings showed that there is little scope for further cost reductions without significantly affecting the Council's ability to maintain Cardiff's parks to their current standard; costs have been reduced by 24% over the last four years. In terms of generating income, we found that income is already generated by Parks and Green Spaces and there is scope to generate more income by using a number of approaches. Some of these approaches could be used without affecting existing park usage whereas others would require changes, such as additional concessions in Parks

Our Inquiry found a huge willingness, across the diverse groups that use our Parks and Green Spaces, to contribute and work in partnership to maintain and improve our Parks. This is evident in the existing excellent partnership working between our dedicated Parks staff, Friends Groups and wildlife organisations and in the responses received from sports pitch user representatives, who are keen to have conversations about how to work together effectively.

Our recommendations centre on clarifying the purpose and focus for Parks Services, in order to direct the scale, scope and acceptable routes for income generation. We also recommended that there are no further cuts to the Park Ranger service.

The report was presented to the Cabinet at its meeting on 17<sup>th</sup> May 2018. A response to the recommendations is expected in September 2018.



## Cardiff Bus Station & Central Train Station

---

Members recognise the importance to residents, commuters, visitors, employers and businesses of having a high quality transport interchange in place as soon as possible. We therefore ensured Committee time was available to undertake regular scrutiny of proposals as these came forward throughout 2017-18. In all, we undertook four different scrutinies of proposals for delivering a new Cardiff Bus Station, the latter of which included the fit of these with Cardiff Central Train Station, and received separate updates on proposals to redevelop the Central Train Station. These focused on exploring the following with Councillor Russell Goodway – Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and senior officers: funding mechanisms, land transactions, the fit with neighbouring regeneration proposals for Central Square, Central Train Station and Central Quay; risk management; and deliverability.

### Pre-Decision Scrutiny – July 2017

The Committee held a joint meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee, to carry out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet on the bus station. At the meeting, Members explored issues relating to the financing of the bus station, including: financial assumptions; how risks to the Council were addressed and mitigated; the timeline for delivering the bus station; and the recommendations to Cabinet.

Following the meeting, the Chair wrote to convey the joint Committee's support for the recommendations to Cabinet in terms of a market driven approach to determining the end use of the space above the bus station. Members asked to be kept informed of progress with a bid to Welsh Government for assistance in meeting technical fit out and highway improvements. Members also highlighted the need to ensure due diligence checks are applied to ensure robust financial modelling and consideration of legal advice.

Councillor Goodway responded to the Chair's letter, stating that the administration would *'seek to achieve the best possible return on the council's investment to ensure that we can deliver the best possible facility but also taking account of the timescales we need to work to if we are to deliver the facility in an acceptable timeframe'*. Councillor Goodway also stated that he would ensure that council officials adopt a robust approach to ensure due diligence.

### Call – In – September 2017

Following Cabinet approval of the report; this was then Called–In by Councillor McEvoy and, in September 2017, the Committee held a joint meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee, to consider the areas specified in the Call-In.

At the Call-In meeting, Members heard from Cllr McEvoy and a representative of Cardiff & Vale Bus Users Group, Dr. Max Wallis, as well as Councillor Russell Goodway and senior officers. Having considered the evidence and the Call-in procedure rules set out in the Council's constitution, Members voted not to refer the item to Full Council or the Cabinet for reconsideration.

### Policy Development Scrutiny – December 2017

In December 2017, Members undertook further scrutiny of confidential information relating to work underway to deliver the new bus station for Cardiff. Members explored with witnesses key factors such as financing and risks to the Council and sought clarification on the next steps and timelines involved. Members also examined the proposals for Cardiff Central Train Station and explored the linkages between this and the Bus Station and Central Square.

Following the meeting, the Chair wrote to Councillor Goodway stating that Members recognise the developments will strengthen Cardiff's economy by improving public transport, Grade 'A' office accommodation offer and retail facilities. The letter also contained a recommendation that *'the publically available drawings/plans be updated to illustrate the [linkages between the various modes of transport - cycling hubs, taxi ranks, taxi drop off and pick up zones]'*, given that the public will be particularly interested in these. Members also recommended that the Council facilitate dialogue between the Access Focus Group and cycling groups to ensure that solutions are identified that are mutually acceptable.

At a later Committee meeting (8 March 2018), Members explored the above recommendations with Councillor Goodway and senior officers, who explained that updated drawings and plans would be prepared for public release once work has moved from the conceptual stage to detailed planning.

### Pre-Decision Scrutiny – March 2018

Finally, on 27 March 2018, we held a special meeting to carry out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet, containing confidential information relating to the proposed funding package for Cardiff Bus Station, between Cardiff Council, Welsh Government and Rightacres Property Ltd and exploring the interface with the Metro Delivery Partnership. Members were supportive of the recommendations to Cabinet and pleased that office space is to be provided above the bus station, as will private rented accommodation. Given the public interest in the delivery of a bus station, Members recommended that a communication plan be put in place to ensure the public are properly informed about the work taking place, the various phases of the work and the timescales involved.

Members asked to receive further information with regard to the Bus Station, including details of the operator model, north-side cycle hub and an updated floor plan for the bus station, including traffic routes for pedestrians, cyclists, buses, coaches, taxis and cars.

Members have been clear that they recognise the importance of undertaking further scrutiny of proposals for the Cardiff Bus Station and the Cardiff Metro Delivery Partnership and have asked to be kept informed of developments.

## Leisure and Sports Scrutiny

---

Members recognise the role the local authority plays in enabling residents to access leisure and sports facilities, thus boosting residents' health and well-being. There have been significant changes in the provision of these services over recent years; Members therefore prioritised scrutiny of these.

### Leisure Management Partnership with GLL

In 2016, GLL took over responsibility for managing most of the Council's leisure centres. Twelve months on, Members wanted to explore whether the delivery of the Leisure Centre Management Partnership between the Council and GLL (Greenwich Leisure Limited) was performing to the agreed level and meeting the needs of Cardiff citizens and communities. Members wanted to know if there were any changes to: the Council's commitments and risks; the proposed capital programme; and service delivery, such as improvements or reductions.

To inform the scrutiny, the Chair, Councillor Howells, issued a press release seeking the views of leisure centre service users, via email and social media, on their experiences. Over 70 service users provided feedback, which gave Members a detailed insight into the issues affecting service users. Members of the Committee received a report summarising the main themes described by respondents.

Members invited representatives from GLL and the Council's client management team, as well as senior officers and Councillor Peter Bradbury (Cabinet Member for Culture and Leisure) to the committee meeting. GLL representatives gave a presentation, providing data on key performance indicators contained in the contract. Members used the information gained from the feedback from service users to explore the issues they raised with GLL and internal witnesses.

At the meeting, GLL were able to clarify some of the issues raised by service users, for example, that service personnel can swim free of charge at any GLL leisure centre, in line with the Armed Forces Covenant. GLL were also able to provide their perspective with regard to some of the issues identified, for example, their aim of ensuring inclusivity and accessibility by developing concessionary charging based on household income.

Following the meeting, the Chair wrote to Councillor Bradbury, seeking support for GLL to provide a response to specific queries raised by those who had provided feedback. The feedback received was sent, in an anonymised form, to Councillor Bradbury, who shared this with GLL and requested a response be prepared that covered all aspects of issues raised by respondents; this has been received from GLL.

The letter from the Chair requested additional information on GLL's customer satisfaction survey, service user profile and number of visits; this was provided as part of Councillor Bradbury's response to the Chair's letter.

Members decided to share the reported success of GLL in reducing sickness absence with the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, scheduled to scrutinise how Cardiff Council could reduce sickness levels; GLL agreed to participate in detailed analysis of their sickness absence data and the approach taken, in order to inform this scrutiny.

Finally, Members welcomed Councillor Bradbury's offer to return to Committee on a regular basis to discuss service delivery in this important area. As part of this, Members specified contract management information they would like to receive at future scrutinies, to enable them to understand usage of the Leisure Centres.

### Sports Development Joint Venture

In 2014, the Council signed a Joint Venture agreement with Cardiff Metropolitan University to deliver sports services in the city. The Sport Cardiff team transferred to the University and new governance arrangements were in put in place, including restructuring the team to reflect the six neighbourhood management areas. The Joint Venture agreement identified priority objectives and key considerations, aimed at boosting involvement in sports by key demographic groups that historically had low participation rates. A Local Sports Plan was developed for 2014 -2017 to detail the actions to be taken to achieve this.

In order to inform this scrutiny, the Chair requested that sports participation trend data be provided, by gender and ethnicity, to show the progress achieved since 2014. Councillor Bradbury, the Council's Sports Development Manager and Sport Cardiff staff attended Committee to provide this information and answer Members questions. Sport Cardiff staff also provided videos, showcasing work undertaken and the impact this has had on

participants. Members heard that work was underway to develop a second Local Sports Plan to cover 2018 onwards.

Following this scrutiny, the Chair wrote to Councillor Bradbury noting contentment with governance arrangements and the day-to-day working of the partnership and requesting historical data prior to the start of the Joint Venture, in order to allow comparison with recent data. This information was provided in the response received from Councillor Bradbury.

### Local Sports Plan 2018-19

Following their scrutiny of the Joint Venture agreement, Members made time to scrutinise the Local Sports Plan 2018-19, developed by Cardiff Council, Cardiff Metropolitan University and partners across Cardiff. Members invited Councillor Bradbury – Cabinet Member Culture & Leisure, senior officers and staff from Cardiff Metropolitan University to discuss the Plan and associated issues at a committee meeting.

Members were pleased with the Plan, noting its breadth and depth and how it focuses on addressing the priority objectives and key considerations set out in the Joint Venture agreement, using small amounts of funding to maximum effect. Members also welcomed the contribution outlined in the Plan re support at Major Events in Cardiff, such as volunteers helping at the forthcoming Volvo Ocean Race Cardiff Stopover.

Members discussed the need to support grassroots participation, highlighting that sports governing bodies and Sport Wales could assist with this by reaching out to communities. As part of this, Members noted that it is important to ensure that sports facilities based within schools remain accessible and affordable to their local communities. Members were pleased to hear that Sport Cardiff signpost to local clubs and assist those clubs to develop long term, sustainable futures.

Finally, Members noted that Sport Cardiff will provide quarterly reports, to Cardiff Council, illustrating the delivery of the Local Sports Plan, using both quantitative and qualitative measures to demonstrate its impact.

## Libraries and Hubs Scrutiny

---

Members recognise the breadth and depth of the services provided by libraries and hubs, reaching into communities, engaging those in need and playing their part in improving people's lives. As such, Members prioritised scrutiny of these services, to monitor performance and assess proposed changes in policy and/or service delivery. Members heard from Councillor Lynda Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing & Communities, with responsibility for Libraries and Hubs, as well as relevant senior officers.

Overall, Members were pleased to note that there will be no reduction in mobile library services or library services.

### Welsh Public Library Standards 5th Framework

Every year, Cardiff Council submits an annual return to the Welsh Government, detailing how it has met the core entitlements set out in the Framework and providing information against quality indicators and impact measures. The Welsh Government undertakes an assessment of the return and provides a report on this, summarising performance.

Members were pleased to note improvements in performance, with the report for 2016/17 showing that Cardiff met all 18 of the core entitlements in full and, of the seven quality indicators that have targets, achieved four quality indicators in full and three in part.

Members discussed the main area of concern highlighted by the report, which is low levels of staffing. Members concluded that the current figures used by the Welsh Government do not include all the staff that are available to assist service users in libraries. In their view, all staff that work in the libraries should be counted towards the indicator; the Committee offered to lend its support in representations on this to Welsh Government.

Members felt ward councillors could take a more proactive role in promoting library services, for example by ensuring Community Councils receive details of services and events in nearby libraries. Members were pleased that officers responded positively to this suggestion.

### Chief Librarian's Universal Offers

The Society of Chief Librarians has worked with key partners, including The Arts Council and The Reading Agency, to identify six key areas of service regarded by service users as integral to public libraries and to develop a 'universal offer' for each of these, providing a positive vision for the future of public libraries. These areas of service are: reading; information; digital; health; learning; and culture.

Members heard how Cardiff libraries are ensuring that the universal offers are provided in Cardiff libraries. As part of the discussion on the health universal offer, Members raised the importance of ensuring that all staff based in hubs and libraries complete dementia awareness training that included explanation of the different types of dementia and the behaviours that result; Members were pleased that officers acknowledged the importance of this.

### Summer Reading Challenge

Members heard that libraries staff held 396 promotional events in libraries and hubs and visited 96% of Cardiff schools to boost participation in the Summer Reading Challenge 2017 and encourage children to join libraries. The 2017 Summer Reading Challenge was the most successful to date, with 7,511 children participating, 5,085 children completing the challenge and 626 children joining the library during the challenge.

Several Members felt that ward councillors could play a more proactive role in encouraging schools to participate in the Summer Reading Challenge. Members were pleased that officers responded positively to this suggestion.

### Employment Services in Cardiff

Members explored proposals for employment services following the cessation of the Communities First programme, which funded a number of employment related training and support services, available to those who lived in Communities First areas. Members heard that the new proposals focused on improving accessibility to employment services across the city. To facilitate this, services will be accessed via a Gateway, which will include face-to-face, phone and internet access points; face-to-face help would be provided in hubs.



At their first scrutiny of this topic, Members highlighted the need to ensure the marketing of the proposed 'gateway' approach to employment services provided reassurance to potential service users about its independence and helpfulness. Members also raised the need to ensure systems are in place to engage potential service users who face difficulties accessing employment services.

At their second scrutiny of this topic, Members were pleased to see that, having raised concerns regarding encouraging access to employment services, the report to Cabinet contained a section on the pro-active approach to be taken to support hard to reach individuals.

### Building Resilient Communities – Developing Community & Well-Being Hubs

The Welsh Government's new approach to tackling poverty includes building strong and resilient communities, with legacy funding available following the cessation of the Communities First programme.

As part of this, Members carried out scrutiny of proposals to create community and well-being hubs in the north and west of Cardiff, bringing community branch libraries into the Hubs management structure, with staff roles developed to offer a wider range of services based on local needs. Members also explored proposals to bring the Central Library Hub within the Advice Services management structure, with the aim of improving and joining up services. In addition, Members heard proposals to develop a new Library Strategy, in order to ensure that Cardiff continues to have strong core library provision that maintains good performance and to develop an enhanced library offer. As part of this, Members heard that it is proposed to provide services across the city, within hubs, schools and other community buildings.

Members highlighted that they wish to carry out further scrutiny as proposals develop, in particular re capital funding and significant changes to current buildings and that they recommend that a future Committee scrutinise performance against Welsh Library Standards. Members also recommended that proposed area reviews take into account public transport linkages to ensure that area boundaries reflect these, so that people can access appropriate services by public transport.

## Regeneration Scrutiny

---

A key role of this Committee is to scrutinise regeneration initiatives, both large-scale, such as Central Square, and small-scale, such as local shopping centres. This year, the Committee has focused on a number of high-profile regeneration proposals, as set out below.

### Cardiff Capital Region City Deal – Joint Working Agreement Business Plan

Members scrutinised the proposed Joint Working Agreement (JWA) Business Plan prior to its consideration at Full Council. The JWA Business Plan sets the context for decisions on the way £495m of City Deal funding (known as the Wider Investment Fund) is to be utilised. It provides details of how proposed investments will assist in meeting the aims of the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal, in terms of the numbers of jobs created, private sector investment secured, support for strategic objectives, delivery of regional economic benefits and value for money. It also sets out that, with regard to Metro Central, the modernisation of Cardiff Central Train Station, the *‘current proposal would see a call on City Deal funding of £40m subject to final approval of the Full Business Case and commitment to match funding from partners’*<sup>4</sup>.

Members heard from the Leader, Councillor Huw Thomas, as well as Councillor Goodway, the Chief Executive and Director of Economic Development. Following the meeting, Committee Members confirmed their support for the City Deal approach and welcomed the approach set out in the draft Business Plan, believing it would bring significant benefits to the City Region. Members pledged to undertake further scrutiny of the Metro proposals and were pleased to hear Councillor Thomas comment that early input from scrutiny would be beneficial regarding Metro Central. Committee Members also highlighted that the roll out work on Skills & Employment, Innovation and Regeneration & Infrastructure will form part of the Committee’s work programming for 2018/19.

Finally, Members were pleased to hear that relationships forged by the City Deal process are being capitalised on to discuss further collaborative working and shared services.

---

<sup>4</sup> page 26, Joint Working Agreement Business Plan.

## Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena

The Administration has committed to deliver a new Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena in the best possible location to ensure it can attract premier national and international events. In October, Members looked at outline proposals, following which Committee Members expressed their support, recognising the benefits to the city region from increased footfall and enhanced infrastructure. Members highlighted the need for officers to explore a range of funding options and to ensure that the business case for the multi-purpose indoor arena clearly detail the likely impact the arena will have on other venues in the city region.

In February, Members held a special meeting to receive confidential information, setting out the results of an options appraisal of potential sites, the rationale for a preferred location for the arena, the risks to the Council and the timeline for delivering the arena.

Following the meeting, the Chair, Councillor Howells, wrote to Councillor Goodway stating that, based on the evidence received, Members support the recommendation to Cabinet regarding the preferred location, subject to future consideration of additional information regarding financial implications and the business case. Members emphasised the need for high quality, reliable and affordable public transport to encourage the additional visitors to Cardiff to use sustainable transport and to avoid adding to the congestion in Cardiff.

Members have been clear that they wish to undertake further pre-decision scrutiny of the detailed delivery strategy for the indoor arena, including the detailed financial implications for the Council and any acquisition of land not currently in Council ownership.

## International Sports Village (ISV)

The administration has a commitment to *'Set a refreshed vision for Cardiff Bay as a leisure destination, by securing a new visitor attraction, with the possible creation of a permanent "beach style" facility and revitalising the strategy for the International Sports Village.'* In March, Committee Members scrutinised confidential papers outlining proposals for the next steps regarding the ISV. Members explored the key factors shaping future plans, risks to the Council, the fit with wider Cardiff Bay regeneration plans and the timeline for delivery.

Having considered the information shared in the confidential session, Members were supportive of the recommendation to Cabinet and highlighted that they wished to undertake further scrutiny of the proposals for revitalising the ISV, as these come forward,

including details on proposed improvements to pedestrian and cycle routes in the Bay, thus enhancing the visitor and resident experience.

### Targeted Regeneration Initiative Programme

The Targeted Regeneration Initiative is a £100 million Welsh Government programme aiming to *'create jobs, enhance skills and employability, and create the environment for businesses to grow and thrive.'*<sup>5</sup> Local authorities are able to submit funding bids, which must demonstrate consultation with affected communities and support from their region.

Members scrutinised the proposals for Cardiff in terms of determining which bids to submit and proposals for establishing appropriate governance to enable regional endorsement of funding bids. Members explored the proposed approach to community consultation and the interface with other partnership working, including other economic development projects. Members also asked about the risks to the Council and how these were being addressed and mitigated.

After the meeting, the Chair, Councillor Howells, wrote to Councillor Lynda Thorne and Councillor Russell Goodway, the responsible Cabinet Members, detailing Committee Members' views. Given the Welsh Government's stated aim of increasing regional working, Members highlighted that they believed it would be prudent to explore the feasibility of establishing governance arrangements that reflect this; this would be preferable to more one-off governance mechanisms.

Members emphasised the need to manage expectations, as part of the community consultation process, to avoid disillusionment in communities if bids are not successful. Members raised the need to involve ward councillors at the outset, to help generate ideas, and were pleased to hear officers acknowledge this.

Members also discussed the need for inclusive growth, to avoid the pitfalls of previous regeneration schemes, which have not always ensured local communities benefit from the schemes.

---

<sup>5</sup> Quote taken from <http://gov.wales/topics/housing-and-regeneration/regeneration/targeted-regeneration-investment/?lang=en> downloaded 4 April 2018

## Corporate Plan & Budgetary Proposals 2018-19

At its February 2018 meeting the Committee considered the Council's draft Corporate Plan and draft budgetary proposals for 2018–19. Members:

- Raised a concern about the geographic and demographic breakdown of the consultation work undertaken in advance of the budget process, and suggested that the Council work closely with Cardiff University to improve the methodological approach and focus on sites that younger people visit;
- Sought clarification on the services, pressures and funding settlements that were causing the growing budget gap;
- Highlighted their concerns at the reduction from 10% (for 2017/18 proposals) to 5% (for 2018/19 proposals) in the savings proposals with detailed planning status;
- Sought clarification on how proper monitoring and review processes could be put in place for future economic development schemes and measuring the benefits for local residents;
- Queried the presentation scale for a graph re Visitor Numbers per Annum;
- Highlighted their wish to scrutinise the proposed historic assets business plan;
- Asked that consideration be given to providing additional revenue funding to support an additional post in Park Ranger service;
- Requested a detailed breakdown of the capital funding for Leisure Centres;
- Requested feedback on where the Council's accountability rests in terms of supporting local businesses and employment prospects of local residents affected by major developments;
- Asked that Cabinet explore a range of options to boost accessibility to adult learning courses which are no longer subsidised by the Council; and
- Requested assurance that the reduction in Libraries Book fund does not take Cardiff below the Welsh Public Library Standards.

Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member - Finance, Modernisation and Performance, responded to the above points, providing the additional information requested and clarifying the administration's position regarding issues highlighted. The request for additional funding for the Park Ranger service was not supported.

# Monitoring Performance

## Quarterly Performance Reports

Scrutiny Committees are responsible for scrutinising performance, thereby facilitating challenge and public discussion, to help drive improvement in service provision. This Committee has reviewed the performance of the following Directorates each quarter:

- Economic Development - *all areas except for Commercial Services, which fall within the terms of reference of Environmental Scrutiny Committee;*
- City Operations - *Parks, Sports, Leisure and Cardiff Harbour Authority service area<sup>6</sup>;*
- People & Communities<sup>7</sup> - *Hubs, Libraries, Into Work and Adult Community Learning elements.*

In setting the Committee's 2017/18 work programme, Members decided to trial a new approach to scrutinising performance. The agreed approach was for Members to receive the relevant sections of the Quarter 1, Quarter 2 and Quarter 3 corporate performance reports for each Directorate by email, with a summary of key points provided by the Committee's Scrutiny Officer. Members then had the opportunity to review the reports and email their comments to their fellow Committee Members. Where Members had concerns about performance, they could request that the relevant Cabinet Member and officer be invited to the next Committee meeting to discuss performance issues and the mitigating actions being taken to address the challenges faced. The Quarter 4 report would be brought to a Committee Meeting, with relevant witnesses, to enable Members to review the whole year performance.

In setting the 2018/19 work programme, the Committee will review the approach taken to Quarterly Performance, its robustness and the quality of scrutiny it provided, and agree an approach to be taken for the future.

---

<sup>6</sup> This service area moved into the Economic Development Directorate at the beginning of Quarter 4.

<sup>7</sup> In Q1-Q3, these services were in the Communities, Housing and Customer Services Directorate

## WORK PROGRAMME FOR 2018- 19

Members of the Committee will be invited to consider items for possible inclusion in the Committee's work programme during 2018-19. Work is currently in progress to draw together issues for the Committee to consider. A draft work programme will then be developed and brought to Committee for approval and implementation. The Committee would welcome suggestions for scrutiny items from other Members.

## FUTURE SCRUTINY WORK

Over the course of its deliberations this year, the Committee has recommended that the following items be considered for inclusion in the Committee's 2018-19 work programme:

- ❖ Cardiff Capital Region City Deal - Metro Delivery Partnership, Skills & Employment, Innovation, Regeneration & Infrastructure.
- ❖ Cardiff Bus Station.
- ❖ Metro Central - Cardiff Central Station.
- ❖ Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena.
- ❖ International Sports Village.
- ❖ Cardiff Bay regeneration.
- ❖ Cardiff Harbour Authority.
- ❖ Historic Assets Business Plan.
- ❖ Changes to Libraries – Central, branch, hubs and new Strategy.
- ❖ Welsh Library Standards.
- ❖ Performance Reports.
- ❖ Savings Reports.
- ❖ Relevant Audit, Inspection and Regulatory Reports.
- ❖ Cabinet Responses to previous Inquiries, and implementation of agreed recommendations from previous Inquiries.

Scrutiny Services, Cardiff Council,  
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW.  
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)  
© 2018 Cardiff Council